DIGITAL GENDER-BASED VIOLENCE against women journalists in PARAGUAY

APPENDIX
1. Focus group guide

The focus groups are a technique used in the study that allow the investigation of a topic from a conversational perspective, in order to feature common narratives in a particular and significant way.

In the focus groups, the group narratives are captured in conversations. This conversation, as a "dynamic and living" act of speech, makes it possible to access common understandings such as attitudes, beliefs, symbols, and common images.

"Narratives are embedded in social action, make events socially visible and characteristically set expectations for future events (...) Narratives are conversational resources, constructs open to ongoing modification as interaction progresses(...) Narratives rather than reflecting, create the sense of what is "truth"."1

The group narratives "tell" about a network of social relations that shape both the production and the understanding of situations in a social universe of meaning.

It is intended to conduct 5 (five) focus groups in five cities in the country. Asunción, Central, Ciudad del Este, Villarrica and Encarnación.

Each focus group will have 15 participants.

Duration 1 hour 10 minutes maximum.

Materials:

- Letter of consent
- Participation forms
- Recorder

Structure

- Presentation: 10 minutes
- Use of the "Guide to combat gender-based digital violence" and discussion: 1 hour.
**Gender digital gap:** refers to the inequality of access to ICTs (Information and Communication Technologies) that exists between individuals, groups, companies or certain geographic areas. For example, the gap faced by women and minority groups are additional barriers to using the Internet and fully participating online, freely and safely.

| 1. Hate speech: form of communication that reflects cultural models that incite violence, either through comments, insults, or verbal aggression. |
| 2. Threats: Speech and content (verbal or written, in images, etc.) with an aggressive and/or threatening tone. Direct threats of violence of any kind. |
| 3. Extortion: forcing a person to act according to the will of another person, through threats and intimidation. |
| 4. Stalking: constant monitoring of a person's online activities, daily life, or information, whether public or private. |
| 5. Harassment: repeated and unsolicited acts against a person or organization that are perceived as intrusive or threatening. |
| 6. Dissemination of non-consensual intimate images: is the publication of content, generally images with explicit or suggestive sexual content, without the consent of the individual depicted and that were taken within a private environment. |

**Digital gender-based violence:** acts of gender-based violence that are committed, incited or aggravated, in whole or in part, through the use of ICTs.

**Consent:** is a legal concept that refers to the externalization of the will between 2 or more people to accept rights and obligations. Consent plays a fundamental role in the framework of the autonomy of will.

**Victim** How is a victim defined? Can I be a victim and a perpetrator at the same time? In digital violence, there must always be a victim? Who are usually the victims on the Internet and why? Can anyone be a victim of gender-based violence on the Internet?

**Time and scale** Does the duration of digital violence matter? The scale? Examples: online harassment, doxxing, social account hacking, surveillance, data exploitation, dissemination of non-consensual intimate image, etc. Is physical violence the same as digital violence? Why?

**Aggressor** What characteristics do you think an aggressor has? Which of the illustrations of all the pictures seems more violent to you? Is it an adult or an animal? Are children violent people? Why? Can you be a violent person? Can there be violence without an aggressor? Is digital gender-based violence the responsibility of natural persons exclusively or also of legal persons (State, companies)?

**Responsibility** Who is responsible for violence in a power relationship? If the aggressor acts under the orders of another person, is he or she responsible? Whose responsibility is it to take care of your life on the Internet? Is the victim responsible for punishment or control? Is a child responsible for his or her life on the Internet?
Power  Is there a power relationship between the aggressors and the victims? Do they know each other or are they strangers? Does one person have power over another? Does one person have power over his or her own body? If a girl were your daughter, would you have power over her and her body? Can she sext? What rights do you have over her and what rights do you not have?

Consequences of digital violence
What are the consequences of digital violence? How do the consequences of digital violence differ from those of physical violence? Does the perpetrator know the consequences of digital violence?

Purpose  Does violence serve a purpose? Are feminist protests that paint walls violent? Why? Do the aggressors have any motivation to exercise violence? What is behind each violence: fun, insecurity, sanction, resistance, revenge? Is it good to be a violent person sometimes in order to do good for more people?

Choice  Do aggressors choose to be violent? If the aggressor had no choice to act differently, can he or she be called violent?

Digital violence

Are women journalists allowed to express their opinions on the internet and in the media on the same topics as male journalists, are there differences, and why?

Digital Gender Gap
Do women have the same access to and use of technology as men? Do indigenous communities have the same access to and use of technology as women? At what age do women and men have their first mobile device? Is there a difference? Why? Can you work and learn on the Internet through your mobile device? Is an educational platform better for learning than in a WhatsApp group? How do women and men connect to the Internet: prepaid, contract or limited data packages, only WIFI from work, neighbors, public spaces. Is there a difference? Can you develop the same skills on a computer as on a mobile device? Example: programming, web design, editing a podcast, etc. Why?

Is technology neutral? Why? Who programs technology? Are there many women and diverse communities that code and build technology? Do you think it is important to include them so that there is no bias in technological solutions? The contents on the Internet are mostly in English, does this exclude people who do not know this language? Is it a form of violence? Are women afraid of technology? Does digital violence deepen the gender digital gap?
Regulations that protect against digital gender violence

Are there regulations that protect women against violence? Do they include sections against gender-based digital violence? How do you think digital violence should be fought? Whose responsibility is it: the State, individuals, companies? Why? Do victims of digital violence in the media want punishment for the aggressors, or do they just want the attacks to stop? What do you think about the victim’s autonomy? If it is a child or adolescent, why? What are the prevention measures that the State should take?
## 2. Guidelines for semi-structured interviews

The following guidelines were tested based on a pilot interview with 5 women journalists who were victims of digital violence on Internet platforms or through technology affecting their safety in the exercise of their profession. The questions are flexible to the conversational dynamics set with the interviewees and can be expanded or modified in their order and scope.

Name:
Profession:
Field of profession:
Age:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Analysis category</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Comments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Identification</td>
<td>Work history, Family</td>
<td>How would you introduce yourself?</td>
<td>The researcher and the individual characteristics of each participant will be considered in the formulation of the questions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Journalist of what media outlet are you? What is your career path? How many years of work? What type of journalistic coverage (topic + editorial)?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perception and assessment of the general context of action.</td>
<td>Socio-economic context, country, city, workplace.</td>
<td>What is it like to live in Paraguay as a journalist?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>What are the main advantages of being a journalist in this country? What are the main difficulties?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Access and Use of Internet</td>
<td>Type of Use Perception of mass use and access to social networks</td>
<td>When did you start using the Internet? How often do you currently connect to the Internet? In our country, how do you perceive the use of social networks? What has changed and how has the use of social networks impacted your work as a journalist?</td>
<td>Here we complement with data package service (purchase of prepaid credit), contract with the ISP (postpaid), office or home Internet or only with the cell phone.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>How do you use social networks in your job? How many social networks do you use? Share at least 3 of the most important ones and why? Explore whether differentiated uses are generated in the networks.</td>
<td>If gender-based violence comes up, related to the context (go into detail)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Are there any differences between the type of content you decide to publish on one network versus another?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>What content do you decide to publish and why?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Do you consider that being a public person means being more exposed in social networks? Why?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Digital Violence</td>
<td>Perception, Knowledge And Attitudes towards digital violence against journalists</td>
<td>Do you think there is violence online? What would count as something aggressive and inappropriate on social networks in your opinion? How would you define digital violence? Is it different from violence that takes place offline? Why? Have you had any experience as a journalist in which you have felt assaulted or violated on social networks? Ask about the story • situation, • aggressor/s, • motives, • extent of impact • escalation to the offline environment In relation to your profession: Did you receive digital violence from your journalistic sources, did you receive digital violence in your workplace? Did this originate on the Internet or did it have a repercussion on the Internet? Did you experience any violence that originated on the Internet and then escalated to the physical? Did you receive violence from social media platforms or internet providers? Did the platforms block any opinions or content you posted on your profile? If so, can you share with us the details? Why do you think this happened? Do you think this is reasonable and fair? What was your reaction when you experienced digital violence? Did you share content with the same frequency after receiving violence? Who did you approach, how did you deal with the situation of online violence? Did you report it? Where and why? Do you consider that your journalistic profile triggers more digital violence? Why? Does your media outlet have prevention and protection protocols for the safety of its journalists? Does it include online gender-based violence? Are you part of a union or group of journalists? In this space do you count the cases of violence and safety of women journalists? Do you include issues of digital violence? Do you know and/or have you heard about the Law 5777/ on Integral Protection against all forms of violence? Do you consider that the national norms are responses for the protection, prevention, justice and compensation for the victims of online gender-based violence against journalists? What policy tool do you consider to be the best response to protect women journalists from online gender-based violence?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectations</td>
<td>Proposal to address digital violence</td>
<td>From your experience, what do you think could be suggested to tackle online violence?</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Explore types of aggression: dissemination of images, what affects women’s dignity or submissiveness? Did you experience violence through technology (monitoring of communications, CCTV in workplaces and public places, etc.)? Emotional, physical, psychological.

Ask if the source harassed you to provide them with information: physical or digital. Inviting you to their home etc.

Use the example of suddenly shutting down the internet service without explanation by the ISP. Or if they censored their profile or content.

Expectations Proposal to address digital violence From your experience, what do you think could be suggested to tackle online violence?
3. Survey

The project "Digital violence against journalists in Paraguay" is developed by TEDIC with the support of the Coalition Against Online Violence (CAOV).

The objective of this project is to conduct a first diagnosis on digital violence against journalists in Paraguay. In this sense, it seeks to encourage and facilitate the development of exploratory research that addresses violence in different areas such as the practice of journalism in Paraguay. It is expected to generate evidence to identify challenges in the framework of policies for the prevention of violence against women and dissident bodies in Paraguay.

You received this survey because you are a journalist in Paraguay. And you are a person who has been identified by the research team as potentially interested in collaborating in the qualitative sample of this research. The personal data provided by participants in the survey will be anonymous at the time of analysis and publishing the results of the survey. No information that is published can be linked to your personal data.

This survey is designed to take a maximum of 30 minutes to complete.

Data Policy

By participating in this research, you have the following rights:

a. To request information about how your personal data is processed and to request a copy of that data.

b. To request that any inaccuracies in your personal data be corrected immediately.

c. To request that incomplete personal data is completed, including by means of a supplementary declaration.

d. To withdraw from the research at any time during the research. Your data will be immediately deleted.

If you wish to contact the TEDIC research coordination:
a. Datos personales

Do you confirm that you agree with the data processing consent as read above?*

- YES
- NO

- Name*
- Last name*
- Identity Card Number*
- Nationality*
- Gender* (Mark with an X)
  - Female / Cis female
  - Male / cis male
  - Trans woman
  - Male trans
  - Transvestite / Transsexual
  - Non-binary person
  - Lesbian
  - Gay
  - Other:

- Age range* (Mark with an X)
  - 18-30
  - 31-40
  - 41-50
  - 51-60
  - 61-70
  - More than 70

- Field of journalism practice:
  - Editorial
  - Research
  - Presenter
  - Cover Story
  - Others

- Are you member of a media outlet? * (Mark with an X)
  - Yes
  - No

- Workplace
  - Printed media
  - TV Channel
  - Radio
  - Digital media
  - Independent media

- Name of the media outlet where you work
b. Accessibility and internet connection

- How do you connect to the Internet for work? (Choose one option)
  - Mobile phone
  - Computer
  - Both
  - Other Specify:
  - None of the above

- How often do you connect to the Internet? (Choose one option)
  - Every day
  - A few times a week
  - A few times a month
  - Other Specify:

- How do you connect to the Internet? (Choose up to 3 options)?
  - With prepaid (balance purchase) on the cell phone
  - With postpaid (contract with internet provider) on cell phone
  - Work Internet
  - Home Internet
  - Public spaces
  - Cafes
  - Other Specify:

- What is the social network or platform you use the most to inform yourself as a journalist? (Choose up to 3 options)
  - Twitter
  - Facebook
  - Instagram
  - TikTok
  - YouTube
  - All of the above
  - Other Specify:

- What is the social network or platform you use the most to communicate as a journalist? (Choose up to 3 options)
  - Twitter
  - Facebook
  - Instagram
  - TikTok
  - YouTube
  - All of the above
  - Other Specify:

- What is the messaging platform you use the most to communicate as a journalist? (Choose up to 3 options)
  - WhatsApp
  - Signal
  - Telegram
  - All of the above
  - Other Specify:
c. Exercising the right to freedom of expression and the right to privacy on the internet

- How much of the total content on your social networks would you place in the following categories? (Check one for each item)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Few</th>
<th>Quite a few</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Information</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Opinion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promotion of activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- When you publish information on your social networks, is it original (own content) or is it reposted/shared. Note: reposted (for example, RT from Twitter) with comments from the user are considered “own content”. (Check one of the boxes)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>None</th>
<th>Few</th>
<th>Quite a few</th>
<th>All</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Own content</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- In social media posts: How do you mostly reply to comments with opinions that differ from your own? Note: The question does not refer to aggressions but to different opinions (Choose one option).

- I always reply, regardless of the type of comment.
- I reply at least once, but I do not extend the debate if I see that there is no chance to reflect with a person.
- I reply only if I think it is possible to reflect with the other person.
- I reply only to the first interactions, regardless of the comment.
- I never reply.

- Have you changed your frequency in the public debate with these divergent groups compared to 2 or 3 years ago? We are not only referring to social networks, but also to participation in debates or reports in traditional media and public spaces in general. (Choose one option)

- The frequency of my debates was greatly reduced.
- The frequency of my debates has been slightly reduced.
- I continue to debate as frequently.
- The frequency of my debates increased somewhat.
- The frequency of my debates has increased a lot.
- I did not debate before and still do not do it now.
d. Digital security and protection for journalists

- Are your profiles in social networks and messaging where you practice journalism protected? Example: Private and/or anonymous profiles (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you use platforms with encryption for communicating? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you enable two-factor authentication on your social networking and messaging profiles? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
    - To all of them
    - Some
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you protect your computer with a password? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you protect your mobile phone with a password? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
    - Pin
    - Fingerprint or facial recognition (biometrics)
    - Pattern
    - Alphanumeric
    - Other Specify:
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you set up digital self-care habits on your cell phone or mobile device? For example: Time limits on usage, muting messages, activating work mode or lifestyle mode, disabling app notifications among others. (Choose one option).
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you use a password manager to store all your profile and account passwords on the Internet?
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know
e. Digital gender-based violence.

We understand that forms of digital gender-based or online violence, refers to acts of gender-based violence committed, instigated or aggravated, in part or as a whole, by the use of Information and Communication Technologies (ICT) social networking platforms and email. (APC 2015).

- Have you received or have you received any digital violence in a social network or messaging in the last 5 years? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you think that the digital violence you receive is due to your gender status? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- How often do you receive digital violence? (Choose one option)
  - Daily
  - Weekly
  - Monthly
  - Every six months
  - Occasionally
  - Never
  - I don’t know

- For what reasons have you received digital violence? (Select all that apply).
  - Physical appearance
  - Gender identity and/or sexual orientation
  - Race/ethnicity
  - Age
  - Party affiliation
  - Social class
  - Feminist activism
  - Occupation
  - Nationality
  - Other Specify:

- Has the level of violence you receive from these sectors changed compared to 2 or 3 years ago? (Choose one option)
  - They attack me with the same intensity.
  - They attack me less than before.
  - I am attacked more than before.
  - Others
What forms of digital violence have you received on social networks? (Select all that apply)

- Digital attack by one or several profiles on social networks triggered by journalistic coverage related to gender.
- Stigmatization ("Women don't have brains"; "Journalists can't talk about politics or sports"; "Trans people are a social aberration").
- Aggressions and insults ("You are not capable"; "Your brain is the size of a chickpea"; "You are a feminazi").
- Threats ("I'm going to kill you"; "We're going to rape you when you leave work"; "You deserve to be raped").
- Dissemination of non-consensual intimate image (This refers to the publication without consent of photos, audios, videos or texts related to the intimacy of the person).
- Doxing (This refers to the access of digital and physical information of a person to then harass him/her: "They find your address from a picture in your networks and send you flowers").
- Identity theft (The use of someone's identity without their consent, or the creating and disseminating false personal data, with the intention of damaging the reputation of a person or organization).
- Defamation and reputational damage through false and offensive online comments.
- Extortion. (Refers to forcing a person to act according to the will of another person, through threats and intimidation).
- Mobbing. (It consists of harassment at work exercised both to a person and to a group. This behavior takes place both outside and inside digital spaces).
- Surveillance (The constant monitoring of a person's online activities, daily life, or information, whether public or private).
- Unauthorized access or account hacking (Unauthorized attacks to gain access to other people's accounts or devices).
- Use of spyware (software to spy and obtain information from other devices) or access to accounts without the user's consent).
- Interception and crossing of calls (Unauthorized access to call data and its capture for wiretapping).
- Distortion of images or videos, or other false content.
- Production of false, manipulated or out-of-context content, and its dissemination with the purpose of discrediting and damaging a person or group.
- Restrictions on the Internet (blocking, removal of the profile by the Platforms).
- Other:
  - I don't know:

When do the aggressions you receive from these sectors take place? (Choose one option)

- Only when I post
- I receive aggression regardless of whether I post or not.
- I am or have been the target of aggressions to the point that campaigns on social or messaging networks have been or are being made against me.

Where did you receive digital violence? (Select all that apply).

- SMS
- Email
- Twitter
- Facebook
- Instagram
- WhatsApp
- Signal
- Telegram
- TikTok
- YouTube
- Others
• When you received digital violence, your reaction was: (Select all that apply).
  ☐ The impulse (not materialized) to close or suspend your profile on that account to prevent further attacks.
  ☐ The impulse (not materialized) to report the aggression in the same social network where I was attacked.
  ☐ Reflections on public exposure on a social network.
  ☐ I reported the aggression in the same social network in which I was assaulted.
  ☐ I temporarily suspended my profile on that network to avoid further attacks.
  ☐ I permanently suspended my profile on that network to avoid further attacks.
  ☐ I started blocking those who attacked me.
  ☐ I stopped reading violent notifications.
  ☐ Not applicable

• In what type of editorial or topic of coverage do you receive digital violence? (Select all that apply).
  ☐ Politics
  ☐ Sports
  ☐ Opinion
  ☐ Local
  ☐ Culture and entertainment
  ☐ Fashion
  ☐ Other

• Where does this digital violence originate? (Select all that apply).
  ☐ It starts in the digital media
  ☐ No relationship to digital media, only physical (Only in traditional media: TV, radio and print).
  ☐ It has an impact in digital media.
  ☐ I don't know

• Did you report the aggressions in any social network, the response of the network: (Select all that apply).
  ☐ I was satisfied, I believe they resolved the subject matter of the complaint.
  ☐ I was not satisfied, they did not resolve the complaint.
  ☐ I did not receive a response.
  ☐ Not applicable

• When there are public debates in the media and press, do you consider that mostly: (Choose one option).
  ☐ The media and show hosts ensure safe spaces for debate, trying to prevent violent situations.
  ☐ The media and hosts do not actively moderate the debate, which often leads to violent situations.
  ☐ The media and hosts favor and encourage confrontation and violence.
  ☐ Not applicable
• What do you think should be the policy of traditional media and social networks regarding digital violence against women journalists? (Check one for each item)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>They should be banned</th>
<th>They should be moderated in some way</th>
<th>They should not intervene</th>
<th>I don’t know</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Traditional media (radio, television, graphic and digital media).</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social media</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

• Have you ever received censorship, blocking or removal of your social media profile by social media platforms? (Choose one option)

- Yes
- Specify which platform
- No
- I do not know

• Has your internet service provider ever disconnected your internet service without prior notification because of your journalist profile? (Select one option)

- Yes
- Specify which platform
- No
- I do not know

• Have you been able to identify your aggressors on the Internet? (Choose one option)

- Yes
- No
- I do not know

• Profile of the aggressors of digital violence you received in the last 5 years (select all that apply).

- State authorities
- Public employees
- Members of the Armed Forces
- Members of the Military and Civil Police
- Companies
- Protestors
- Identified private actors
- Businessmen
- Media (Company)
- Union leaders
- Religious leaders
- Organized social groups or social movements
- Anti-rights groups or conversationalists
- Organized crime groups, drug traffickers, guerrillas, paramilitaries and militias
- Trolls and troll-centers
- Justice groups
- Unidentified persons (Anonymous)
- The journalistic source
- Intermediary platforms (social networks, search engines and internet providers)
- Coworkers in the journalistic environment
- Others
f. Prevention, justice and journalistic safety

- Do you know or have you heard about the Law 5777 of Integral Protection against all forms of violence? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Did you know that this law includes something related to digital violence? The law refers to it as "Telematic Violence." Article 6, Subsection L of Law 5777. (Select one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Do you consider that national regulations are the answer to the protection, prevention, justice and reparation for victims of violence against journalists? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Have you already reported issues of digital violence to the judicial system? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No

- If the answer to the previous question was yes, what was your perception of the judicial outcome? (Choose one option)
  - Satisfactory
  - Sufficient
  - Insufficient
  - Null

- Would you recommend that journalists report digital violence to the judicial system? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

- Does the media company you work for have protocols for the prevention and protection of the safety of its journalists? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I don't know
  - Not applicable
  - Other Specify:
• Does the media company where you work include its protocols on violence in general and digital violence in particular? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I don’t know
  - Not applicable

• Are you part of a journalists’ union or group? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No

• If you are part of a journalists’ union or group, do you count the cases of violence and safety of women journalists? (Choose one option)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

• If the answer to the previous question is yes, do they include digital violence topics? (Choose one)
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

• Do you feel unsafe in your job because of the digital violence abuses you have suffered?
  - Yes
  - No
  - I do not know

• Have you reported the online violence you are receiving at work (media)?
  - Yes
  - No
  If yes, have you received support from your supervisor? Please detail in what way.

• What steps could the media outlet take to support you and others who are abused online? Please provide details below.